



Three-Year Audit Template

Introduction to the tool

The three-year audit template was developed by FishChoice and is based on the FisheryProgress FIP Review Guidelines and feedback from the FisheryProgress Technical Oversight Committee. The audit template is designed to present key information about the current performance of the fishery and to verify reported progress on www.FisheryProgress.org. **FisheryProgress requires the use of three-year audit template and information must be in English.**

Text in italics provides additional guidance about information that should be included in each section. Text in red provide examples for possible responses.

Basic FIP information

Fill in the following table. The management authority is the regulatory authority with fishing management responsibilities; there may be multiple authorities where joint jurisdictional responsibilities occur.

Target species scientific name and common name	<i>Pecten maximus</i> Great scallop, king scallop
Fishery location	Area 27 (Atlantic, Northeast)
Gear type(s)	Dredge
Catch quantity (weight)	FIP landings estimate: 13823 metric tons Fishery Landings estimate: 20240 metric tons
Vessel type(s) and size(s)	>10m vessels
Number of vessels	To be confirmed
Management authority	UK government bodies: Defra, Daera, Marine Scotland

Stakeholder consultation & meetings

Fill in the following table and include a high-level summary of the subjects that were discussed. Additional rows may need to be added or modified depending on number of participants and meetings completed.

Name	Affiliation	Date and Subjects Discussed
Jen Mouat	RIFG	<u>4th March 2019</u>
Carrie McMinn	AFBI	1. Update on steering group member activities since the previous meeting
Matthieu Lundy	AFBI	2. Update work with EDP renewables and carrying out stock assessments on behalf of the scallop fishery
Alan McCulla	ANIFPO	3. Reminder of FIP structure and timelines
Andy Lawler	Cefas	4. Introduction to the Scallop Industry Consultation Group's formation and activity.
Jessica Harvey	Cefas	5. Overview of the pre-assessment and action plan; allocation of leads for the three principles.
Ewen Bell	Cefas	
Elaine Whyte	CIFA	
Kenny McNabb	CIFA	
Aisla Jones	Co-op	
Roy Griffin	Daera	<u>18th June 2019</u>
Coco Bagley	Defra	1. Recap of FIP structure
Helen Hunter	Defra	2. Update on windfarm funding for stock status. Partial funding approved
Anton Dietschel-Buehler	Flatfish	3. Stock status discussion; harvest strategy presentation from Seafish
Jim Fyall	Fyfe PO	4. Updates and actions for Principles 1, 2 and 3
Mairi Fenton	Heriot Watt	
Mike Kaiser	Heriot Watt	
Peter Duncan	Isle of Man government	<u>30th September 2019</u>
Calum Duncan	LINK	1. Call purpose: Address actions on primary and secondary species & ETP, workload involved and the capacity to accomplish them.
Hannah Macintyre	M&S	2. Initiate idea for running a SICA analysis
Claire Pescod	Macduff	
Andrew Brown	Macduff	
Jim Watson	Marine Scotland	
Stuart Bell	Marine Scotland	<u>7th November 2019</u>
Joe Prosho	Morrison's	1. Presentation on Project UK scallop FIPs to the ICES Scallop Working Group to highlight alignments with ICES workplans
Lynda Blackadder	Marine Scotland Science	2. Catch composition of Nephrops and Scallops fisheries – obtaining data in NI and Scotland
Rob Whiteley	Natural England	3. Actions: Scallops and Nephrops ETP and habitats
David Donnan	NatureScot	4. Agreement to consult experts on running a SICA analysis
Adam Townley	NESI	
Ben Collier	NI gear trials	
Harry Wick	NIFPO	
Hannah Fennell	Orkney Fisheries Association	<u>27th November 2019</u>
Kate Rydowski	Association	1. Governance and re-branding from PUKFI to Project UK.
Bill Lart	Orkney Sustainable	2. Principle 1 action updates (stock status: ICES reference points; Harvest strategy: development of an alternative measures report; Harvest Control Rules: discussion on compliance and adoption; info & monitoring; Stock status assessment in Orkney commencing)
Ella Brock	Fisheries	
Sally Stewart Moore	Seafish	
Stuart McInaghan	Seafish	

David Leiper	Seafish
Adam Holland	Seafish
Malcolm Morrison	Seafood Eccose
John Anderson	Seasource/NIFF
Paul Macdonald	SFF
Jimmy Buchan	SFO
Jim Portus	SFO
Kenny Coull	SSA
Mike Park	SICG
Juliette Hatchman	SWFPA
Helena Delgado	SWFPA
Andy Boulton	SWFPO
Stuart King	Tesco
Simon Macdonald	Waitrose
Hayley Swanlund	West Coast Producers
Clarus Chu	RIFG
Bryce Beukers-Stewart	WWF
Cameron Moffat	WWF
Mike Mitchell	University of York
Foster Gault	Youngs
Lief Hendrikz	Youngs

3. Principle 2 action updates (Secondary species: environmental subgroup enabling progress through access to supporting papers on bycatch; ETP: species list developed; Habitats: scallop management based on fishery footprint that encounters vulnerable marine ecosystems; Ecosystems – development of a SICA).
4. Principle 3 actions and updates
Open Seas presentation and proposal for joining the Steering Group.

6th May 2020

1. Arrival of the COVID-19 pandemic affected steering group meeting scheduling.
2. Alternative Measures report idea signed off. Scallop catch and bycatch data actioned for collection; proposal to review data gaps and submit a request to ICES to review any knowledge gaps.
3. ETP: Masters project launch on ETP interactions with the scallop fishery. Habitats: PhD project launch on best practice of habitat management. Ecosystems: Designing the SICA.
4. Nephrops – primary and second species: Species identified; gear use; Habitat: Masters project launch to create risk assessment maps that identify FU’s unlikely of meeting SG60 due to fishing impact on wider habitat.

19th May 2020

1. Nephrops: Harvest Strategy – Discussion on possible approaches to regional management.
2. Nephrops: Landing Obligation compliance – comparison in to EU fisheries and action to involve devolved administrations (DA).
3. Scallops: SICG management paper – options for the UK scallops fishery (links to HS /HCR actions). Progress delayed by COVID occupying the DA’s attention; FMP plan review.
4. Steering Group agreed not to permit Open Seas to join the Steering Group.

25th August 2020

1. Review the recently completed University of York Masters research on scallop dredge fishery interaction with Endangered, Threatened and Protected (ETP) species in the North Sea, West of Scotland and the Irish Sea, and to discuss next steps

12th October 2020

1. Discuss Principle 3 (management) actions; and agree roles and responsibility for sections within the Fishery Management Plan.

13th October 2020

1. Review progress made against each of the actions under Principle 1 and 2 in the UK scallop Fishery Improvement Project (FIP) Action Plan and agree on next steps.

3rd March 2021

Scallops SICA workshop

1. This workshop brought together experts from the UK scallop Steering Group and wider field to focus on the Ecosystem component of Principle 2 (P2). Using the Scale, Intensity, Consequence Analysis (SICA) methodology, this workshop was to provide qualitative analysis from experts, in the absence of quantitative evidence, to justify selection of scoring guideposts in the SICA. This is permitted within MSC methodology and Risk Based Framework. Outcomes to be collated and reported by Poseidon.

22nd April 2021

1. Review progress made against each of the actions under Principles 1 and 3 in the Round 2 scallop Fishery Improvement Project (FIP) action plan before the second annual review takes place.
2. The Marine Stewardship Council (MSC) presented the commercial opportunities for certified scallop products.

29th April 2021

1. Review progress made against each of the actions under Principle 2 (wider environmental impacts) in the Round 2 scallop Fishery Improvement Project (FIP) action plan.
2. Reports underway for Secondary species: Scottish bycatch report, Northern Ireland bycatch report, Alternative measures report
3. Updates on the habitats action

15th September 2021

1. Review progress from the annual review, and discuss actions for Principle 1 and 2.

21st September 2021

1. Review progress made against each of the actions under Principle 1 and 3 in the UK scallop Fishery Improvement Project (FIP) action plan and to discuss the new FisheryProgress.org social policy requirements

25th January 2022

1. Review of progress ahead of annual review and update on habitats PhD

Summary of MSC performance indicator scores

Fill in the likely scoring category (<60, 60-79, ≥80) for each performance indicator (PI) and provide a rationale for the score by referring to the text used in v2.0 of the MSC Standard's scoring guideposts for the related Performance Indicator.

Principle	Component	Performance Indicator	Previous Score	Current Score	Rationale and Justification
1	Outcome	1.1.1 Stock status	60-79	60-79	Most stocks do not have an assessment with sufficient information for reference points to be established. ICES WG Scallop have discussed reference points, and are considering how to address this further. Marine Science Scotland plans to establish reference points when capacity permits. Cefas stock assessment (Cefas, 2022) for scallops in the North Sea (4.b.S) and Dogger Bank (4.b.D) have not yet defined MSY candidates for HRMSY. Estimations indicate it is likely that the stock is above the point where recruitment would be impaired.
		1.1.2 Stock rebuilding	N/A	N/A	N/A
	Management	1.2.1 Harvest Strategy	<60	<60	There has not been any substantive change in the proposed interventions management paper due to delays in feedback from the Devolved Administrations. RIFGs and inshore fishermen should be more actively engaged through the project and the FMP should align with current Marine Scotland strategy and policy. Progress has been affected by both the Covid pandemic and Brexit. The proposals are expected to achieve the stock management objectives, but is also hampered by progress in 1.1.1. The delivery of the national FMP referred to in the Fisheries Act and the Joint Fisheries Statement will address the requirements for the harvest strategy and harvest control rules. Several management interventions have been put out

						for consultation by the devolved administrations, including latent capacity and management of <15m fleet.
		1.2.2	Harvest control rules and tools	<60	<60	Reference points are on the agenda for the ICES WG Scallop, but have not been agreed as yet. Formal HCRs will be developed through the Scallop Industry Consultation Group FMP process.
		1.2.3	Information and monitoring	60-79	60-79	There is evidence of using a gap analysis to identify information gaps and reports produced to reduce them. Devolved Administrations have undertaken surveys when not limited by capacity, in 2020 and 2021, and there are plans for surveys in 2022. Alternative options for a stock assessment have been explored through the ICES WG Scallop.
		1.2.4	Assessment of stock status	60-79	60-79	Initial stock surveys have been completed in Orkney and Clyde. AFBI (Northern Ireland) carried out a scallop survey in the Irish Sea in Feb 2020. Irish Sea stock assessment is part of ICES WG Scallop ToR and being progressed in a three-year time frame (2020-2023). Stock surveys are being delivered through co management with the SICG and Defra, as well as by Marine Scotland Science.
2	Primary species	2.1.1	Outcome	>80	>80	Main primary species are highly likely to be above the PRI.
		2.1.2	Management strategy	>80	>80	There is a partial strategy in place for the UoA, if necessary, that is expected to maintain or to not hinder rebuilding of the main primary species at/to levels which are highly likely to be above the PRI.
		2.1.3	Information	>80	>80	Some quantitative information is available and is adequate to assess the impact of the UoA on the main primary species with respect to status.

	Secondary species	2.2.1	Outcome	60-79	60-79	Analysis is available from Marine Science Scotland and AFBI on secondary species (catch composition by quantity and weight, and some information on the damage index). Seafish have completed an alternative measures paper to review alternative scallop dredge gear and management measures and document their effectiveness at minimising mortality.
		2.2.2	Management strategy	<60	60-79	Protocol and process for undertaking a regular review of alternative measures to reduce unwanted catch has been established and completed, demonstrable in a report published by Seafish in 2021.
		2.2.3	Information	60-79	>80	Bycatch data has been gathered by Marine Scotland Science and AFBI to provide quantitative data on total catch from scientific dredge and commercial dredge gear.
	ETP species	2.3.1	Outcome	<60	<60	Information is still being gathered to indicate the likelihood of hindering the recovery of ETP species that interact with the fishery.
		2.3.2	Management strategy	<60	<60	Approaches to identifying and logging ETP interaction are being considered and trialed by industry volunteers.
		2.3.3	Information	60-79	60-79	Data is available from a GIS-based risk assessment showing potential ETPs interacting with UoAs, and then mapping of ETP distribution overlap with UoA dredging effort.
	Habitats	2.4.1	Outcome	<60	60-79	Outcomes from an ongoing PhD project will inform this PI.
		2.4.2	Management strategy	<60	<60	Documentation showing a summary of scallop management measures within MPAs, SACs and any other designated sites is still required. The data from the PhD will inform management.
		2.4.3	Information	<60	60-79	A 3-year PhD (2020-2022) is underway titled: Understanding the consequences of scallop dredging in relation to seabed habitat types,

						conservation features and other industry sectors.
	Ecosystem	2.5.1	Outcome	60-79	60-79	A number of workstreams and review processes are being implemented to identify and recommend further research and management actions that reduce disruption to the ecosystem and ecosystem services to acceptable levels..
		2.5.2	Management strategy	60-79	60-79	A SICA workshop with an expert group on scallop dredge ecosystem impacts was held through a virtual, interactive workshop. The reviewed report will guide the management strategy.
		2.5.3	Information	>80	>80	Information is adequate to broadly understand the key elements of the ecosystem
3	Governance and Policy	3.1.1	Legal and customary framework	60-79	60-79	An effective national legal system and a framework for cooperation with other parties is being identified in the Irish Sea UoA. The UK Fisheries Act 2020 also provides a broadly robust legal framework.
		3.1.2	Consultation, roles and responsibilities	60-79	60-79	Roles and responsibilities remain to be fully documented. This will be documented by the Scallop Industry Consultation Group through the FMP process.
		3.1.3	Long term objectives	>80	>80	Clear long term objectives that guide decision making, consistent with MSC Fisheries Standard and the precautionary approach, are explicit within management policy.
	Fishery specific management system	3.2.1	Fishery specific objectives	60-79	60-79	These are being developed by the Scallop Industry Consultation Group, and are expected to be published in 2023.
		3.2.2	Decision making processes	60-79	60-79	There is a commitment to work with industry to establish appropriate management systems. The new SICG co-management group is to cover all Devolved Administrations. The way in which the SICG and SSSWG will work together is yet to be determined but a Terms of Reference is being developed.

		3.2.3	Compliance and enforcement	60-79	60-79	This PI's progress is reliant on Devolved Administration timelines for iVMS implementation. A proposed monitoring system is being delivered through the Scotland's Fisheries Management Strategy commitments for REM and tracking technology and associated consultation processes for implementation.
		3.2.4	Management performance evaluation	60-79	60-79	Management groups SICG and SSSWG need to agree performance evaluation procedures with a focus on internal review.

Workplan results

Fill in the following table by reviewing the FIP's workplan and summarizing the key results that have been achieved over the last three years (or since the last audit took place) as a result of the FIP's workplan. Provide an explanation of steps that the FIP participants took in supporting and achieving each result.

Result	Related Action on FisheryProgress	Related MSC Performance Indicator	Explanation
Length-weight estimates of bycatch research	Information of secondary species in the fishery increased	2.2.3	<p>An action for the FIP is to understand what the 'main' and 'minor' bycatch species in the fishery are. Previously, information was passed centrally to the EU data collection framework (DCF) which includes discards by species and presents data as if it is in tonnage. Cefas provided this data as number of individuals, so expect the units of measure to be incorrect in the DCF.</p> <p>Numbers of individuals & their lengths that are recorded within the observer program have been converted into biomass. This would be based on estimates of biomass per species and length category. Cefas observer sampling does not have at-sea balanced scales, so cannot record biomass at sea, hence use of lengths and number of individuals. This report has provided the FIP with some quantitative info. Marine Scotland Science continues to work on a bycatch paper which is currently being reviewed internally before publishing. Results from Northern Ireland have been shared. This data will provide the FIP with quantitative information to support any further work on secondary species going forward.</p>
Alternative measures report produced	Information of secondary species in the fishery increased	2.2.3	<p>A review of alternative measures was undertaken for mechanical dredge targeting king scallop to better understand how the FIP can reduce the interaction with unwanted and undersized secondary species; with the review is applicable to both the Round 1 Channel Scallop and Round 2 UK Scallop FIPs.</p> <p>The review includes consideration of whether alternative gear or other measures have been implemented as appropriate and/or whether there was the scope for the FIP to adopt new approaches in the fishery to help reduce interactions with secondary species.</p> <p>Due to technical gear regulations, a derivation is required to change gear specifications, including ring size and attachment of skis to the dredge. Trials are underway through Heriot-Watt University and</p>

			<p>Bangor University to explore efficiency of gear adaptations, including addition of skis. Factors to be analysed include, bycatch rates, catch rates of target species, gear seabed penetration and efficiency.</p> <p>The process for the regular review of alternative measures will be documented within the FMP for the FIP.</p>
Information on ETP species are regularly collected and monitored	Design and review of ETP reporting log	2.3.3	<p>An extensive review of the ETP species list in the pre-assessment by the Environmental sub-group to ensure a comprehensive list that reflected developments in Marine Protected Areas and environmental legislation.</p> <p>The ETP review found that that there were new species to be added and that the occurrence of elasmobranchs is considered rare and individuals are returned to sea. However, there remained a need for the FIP to log these interactions as well as record the determination of the interaction (released alive, retained, discarded). Poseidon were contracted to design the reporting log, which has been completed and as a next step needs trialing with willing skippers. Of note, these reporting logs can be used in conjunction with skate and ray ID guides designed in collaboration with the Shark.</p> <p>A Masters project looked at the spatial overlap of ETP species with this fishery, and a PhD student is looking at the overlap of benthic ETP species. The extend of the overlap will influence management measures.</p> <p>Industry members are preparing to trial the ETP reporting app.</p>
Fishery footprint analysis and habitat mapping.	Habitat outcome, management and information	2.4.1, 2.4.2, 2.4.3	<p>A PhD student at Heriot Watt University is researching the impact of the scallop fishery on VMEs and commonly encountered habitat, as well as length of time to recover. Results from the research's first year have produce an overlap map including initial indications of where management may be needed.</p> <p>The assessment that was carried out undertook:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) A species by species approach to understand the sensitive species present in the Unit of Assessment (UoA). 2) A whole community approach to understand habitat vulnerability, using the Bangor University Benthic Habitat Tool

<p>Scale Intensity Consequence Analysis (SICA) analysis of scallop dredging in the UoA of the FIP.</p>	<p>Ecosystem: Outcome status</p>	<p>2.5.1</p>	<p>An expert group was convened and a SICA workshop conducted. The report identified the functional group composition as the most relevant ecosystem sub-component to be affected by the fishery. The report concluded that the consequence score is likely to be 60 due to the spatial and temporal footprint of the activity as well as the type of gear used and its known impact on the benthos.</p> <p>As a result of these findings the potential management actions are aligned with the objectives for ETP and habitats actions which include spatial restrictions to fishing operations.</p>
<p>Development of a Fishery Management Plan</p>	<p>Fishery-specific objectives and decision-making processes</p>	<p>3.2.1, 3.2.2</p>	<p>The development of an FMP began in 2020 to help log all the documentation and progress the FIP had made to date. The FIP decided to align with the SICG around management objectives, with an SICG/FIP member from Macduff acting as the point of contact to log all relevant work.</p> <p>The Joint Fisheries Statement consultation outlines long term objectives but short term objectives are still being determined.</p>